

MELINDA BIRD (SBN 102236)  
MONISHA A. COELHO (SBN 219233)  
DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA  
350 South Bixel Street, Suite 290  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Telephone: (213) 213-8000  
Facsimile: (213) 213-8001  
[melinda.bird@disabilityrightsca.org](mailto:melinda.bird@disabilityrightsca.org)  
[monisha.coelho@disabilityrightsca.org](mailto:monisha.coelho@disabilityrightsca.org)

*Attorneys for Named Plaintiffs and the Class*  
*Additional Attorneys for Named Plaintiffs and the*  
*Class on Signature Page*

STEPHEN P. BERZON (SBN 46540)  
EVE H. CERVANTEZ (SBN 164709)  
STACEY M. LEYTON (SBN 203827)  
PEDER J. THOREEN (SBN 217081)  
RACHEL J. ZWILLINGER (SBN 268684)  
Altshuler Berzon LLP  
177 Post Street, Suite 300  
San Francisco, California 94108  
Telephone: (415) 421-7151  
Facsimile: (415) 362-8064  
[sberzon@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:sberzon@altshulerberzon.com)  
[ecervantez@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:ecervantez@altshulerberzon.com)  
[sleyton@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:sleyton@altshulerberzon.com)  
[pthoreen@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:pthoreen@altshulerberzon.com)  
[rzwillinger@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:rzwillinger@altshulerberzon.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs SEIU-UHW, SEIU-ULTCW, SEIU*  
*Local 521, SEIU California State Council, UDW, and CUHW*

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO/OAKLAND DIVISION

DAVID OSTER, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WILL LIGHTBOURNE, Director of the California  
Department of Social Services; TOBY DOUGLAS,  
Director of the California Department of Health Care  
Services; CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
CARE SERVICES; and CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT  
OF SOCIAL SERVICES,

Defendants.

Case No. CV 09-04668 CW

**STIPULATION AND ORDER  
CONTINUING THE FURTHER  
CASE MANAGEMENT  
CONFERENCE PENDING  
RESOLUTION OF DEFENDANTS'  
PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION  
APPEALS IN THE NINTH  
CIRCUIT**

1 WHEREAS, a Case Management Conference is scheduled in this case for October 24,  
2 2012;

3 WHEREAS, Defendants' preliminary injunction appeal with respect to ABX 4 4 is  
4 currently pending in the Ninth Circuit, which has not yet issued its decision;

5 WHEREAS, oral argument on that appeal was heard and the matter submitted on June  
6 15, 2010;

7 WHEREAS, the Ninth Circuit vacated the submission and deferred resolution of that  
8 preliminary injunction appeal pending the United States Supreme Court's decision in the  
9 consolidated appeals of *Douglas v. Indep. Living Ctr. of S. Cal., et al.*;

10 WHEREAS, the United Supreme Court has now issued its ruling in *Douglas*;

11 WHEREAS, on May 21, 2012, the Ninth Circuit ordered the parties to submit letter briefs  
12 regarding the mootness impact upon the appeal, if any, of California Welfare & Institutions Code  
13 §§12309(i) and 12309.2(e);

14 WHEREAS, those briefs were filed on July 20, 2012;

15 WHEREAS, Defendants filed a preliminary injunction appeal with respect to SB 73 on  
16 February 21, 2012 and March 5, 2012;

17 WHEREAS, Defendants filed their opening brief on April 3, 2012; Plaintiffs filed their  
18 answering brief on July 19, 2012 and Defendants filed their reply brief on August 16, 2012;

19 WHEREAS, the Ninth Circuit has not yet set a date for oral argument with respect to  
20 Defendants' appeal of this Court's preliminary injunction regarding SB 73;

21 WHEREAS, a further case management conference had been set in this case for July 25,  
22 2012, but was continued by agreement of the parties to October 24, 2012;

23 WHEREAS, the parties agree that it would be more efficient for the Court and the parties  
24 to continue the further case management conference pending resolution of the preliminary  
25 injunction appeals;

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED between the parties through their respective counsel that,  
subject to Court approval:

1. The further case management conference scheduled for October 24, 2012 is taken off calendar.
2. A further case management conference is rescheduled for January 23, 2013, at 2:00 p.m.
3. The parties, by filing another Stipulation and [Proposed] Order, may request an earlier or later date for the further case management conference depending on the date(s) the Ninth Circuit issues its opinion(s).

Dated: October 15, 2012

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Melinda Bird  
MELINDA BIRD (SBN 102236)  
MONISHA A. COELHO (SBN 219233)  
DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA  
LOS ANGELES REGIONAL OFFICE  
350 South Bixel Street, Suite 290  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Telephone: (213) 213-8000  
Facsimile: (213) 213-8001  
[melinda.bird@disabilityrightsca.org](mailto:melinda.bird@disabilityrightsca.org)  
[monisha.coelho@disabilityrightsca.org](mailto:monisha.coelho@disabilityrightsca.org)

SUJATHA JAGADEESH BRANCH (SBN 166259)  
DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA  
SACRAMENTO REGIONAL OFFICE  
1831 K Street  
Sacramento, CA 95811  
Telephone: (916) 504-5800  
Facsimile: (916) 504-5801  
[sujatha.branch@disabilityrightsca.org](mailto:sujatha.branch@disabilityrightsca.org)

DARA L. SCHUR (SBN 98638)  
ELISSA GERSHON (SBN 169741)  
DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA  
BAY AREA REGIONAL OFFICE  
1330 Broadway, Suite 500  
Oakland, CA 94612  
Telephone: (510) 267-1200  
Facsimile: (510) 267-1201  
[dara.schur@disabilityrightsca.org](mailto:dara.schur@disabilityrightsca.org)

1 PAULA PEARLMAN (SBN 109038)  
2 DISABILITY RIGHTS LEGAL CENTER  
3 919 Albany Street  
4 Los Angeles, CA 90015  
5 Telephone: (213) 736-1031  
6 Facsimile: (213) 736-1428  
7 [paula.pearlman@lls.edu](mailto:paula.pearlman@lls.edu)  
8 [shawna.parks@lls.edu](mailto:shawna.parks@lls.edu)

6 CHARLES WOLFINGER (SBN 63467)  
7 LAW OFFICE OF CHARLES WOFLINGER  
8 4655 Cass Street # 314  
9 San Diego, CA 92109  
10 Telephone: (858) 272-8115  
11 Facsimile: (858) 270-3960  
12 [Cw@charleswolfinger.com](mailto:Cw@charleswolfinger.com)

10 JANE PERKINS (SBN 104784)  
11 NATIONAL HEALTH LAW PROGRAM  
12 101 East Weaver Street, Suite G-7  
13 Carrboro, NC 27510  
14 Telephone: (919) 968-6308  
15 Facsimile: (919) 968-8855

14 ABIGAIL K. COURSOLLE (SBN 266646)  
15 NATIONAL HEALTH LAW PROGRAM  
16 3701 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 750  
17 Los Angeles, CA 90010  
18 Telephone: (310) 736-1652  
19 Facsimile: (213) 368-0774  
20 [coursolle@healthlaw.org](mailto:coursolle@healthlaw.org)

18 ANNA RICH (SBN 230195)  
19 NATIONAL SENIOR CITIZEN LAW CENTER  
20 1330 Broadway, Suite 525  
21 Oakland, CA 94612  
22 Telephone: (510) 663-1055  
23 Facsimile: (510) 663-1051  
24 [arich@nslc.org](mailto:arich@nslc.org)

22 *Attorneys for Individual Named Plaintiffs David*  
23 *Oster, Willie Beatrice Sheppard, C.R., Dottie Jones,*  
24 *Andrea Hylton, Helen Polly Stern, Charles*  
25 *Thurman, L.C., and the Plaintiff Class*

25 /s/ Stacey Leyton  
26 STEPHEN P. BERZON (SBN 46540)  
27 EVE H. CERVANTEZ (SBN 164709)  
28 STACEY M. LEYTON (SBN 203827)  
PEDER J. THOREEN (SBN 217081)  
RACHEL J. ZWILLINGER (SBN 268684)  
Altshuler Berzon LLP  
177 Post Street, Suite 300  
San Francisco, California 94108  
Telephone: (415) 421-7151

Facsimile: (415) 362-8064  
[sberzon@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:sberzon@altshulerberzon.com)  
[ecervantez@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:ecervantez@altshulerberzon.com)  
[sleyton@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:sleyton@altshulerberzon.com)  
[pthoreen@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:pthoreen@altshulerberzon.com)  
[rzwillinger@altshulerberzon.com](mailto:rzwillinger@altshulerberzon.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs SEIU-UHW, SEIU-ULTCW,  
SEIU Local 521, SEIU California State Council,  
UDW, and CUHW*

Dated: October 15, 2012

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Susan M. Carson

KAMALA HARRIS

Attorney General of California

SUSAN M. CARSON

Supervising Deputy Attorney General

GREGORY D. BROWN (SBN 219209)

NIMROD ELIAS (SBN 251634)

Deputy Attorneys General

California Dept. of Justice

455 Golden Gate Ave Ste 11000

San Francisco, CA 94102

[Susan.Carson@doj.ca.gov](mailto:Susan.Carson@doj.ca.gov)

*Attorneys for Defendants*

#### GENERAL ORDER 45 ATTESTATION

I, Stacey Leyton, am the ECF user whose ID and password are being used to file this stipulation. In compliance with General Order 45, X.B, I hereby attest under the penalty of perjury that concurrence regarding filing this document has been obtained from each of its signatories.

Dated: October 15, 2012

/s/ Stacey Leyton

Stacey Leyton

**ORDER**

GOOD CAUSE APPEARING, pursuant to stipulation and in light of the Ninth Circuit's oral argument schedule in this case, the Case Management Conference scheduled for October 24, 2012 is continued to April 10, 2013.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: 10/17/2012

  
Hon. Claudia Wilken  
United States District Judge